# Meta-Analysis of the Effect of Professionalism on Service Quality in Indonesia in 2015-2019

<sup>1</sup>Rangguni Cemerlaning Tias, <sup>2</sup>Dr. Meitiana, S.E., M.M, <sup>3</sup>Trikarunia Ningsih, <sup>4</sup>Noveri Mamben

Abstract: This study focuses on the correlation between professionalism and service quality. Most theorists believe that professionalism is positively correlated with service quality. However, surveys of 10 studies with a total sample size of 41.43 showed a wide variation in the correlation coefficient, from 0.452 to 0.809. This study applies a meta-analysis of the 10 studies to find the true correlation of professionalism and service quality. Procedures for sampling error correction and measurement error correction have been performed, with an average of 0.61, which is significantly positive at 88.33% confidence intervals. Further analysis found indications that other variables influence the strength of the correlation, leading to opportunities to conduct further specific meta-analysis studies.

**Keywords:** Meta-Analysis, Professionalism, Service Quality

#### 1. INTRODUCTION

Professionalism is one of the important factors that must be had by every employee in an organization because professionalism is the properties (abilities, skills and ways of implementing something) as naturally present and carried out by a professional. So if the company has professional and highly capable employees, it will help the company to achieve company objectives. The term professionalism comes from the word profession, which means a job that requires knowledge, includes knowledge, skill and method, and apply to all employees from top to bottom.

Employee's professionalism is determined by the level of employee capability reflected in daily behavior in the organization. High levels of employee capability will lead to the achievement of organizational objectives that have been previously planned, in the other hand, if the level of employee ability is low, the tendency of organizational objectives to be achieve will be slow or even deviate from the main plan. Professionalism is needed in the organization. Professional human resources are needed, because it will create good ability and commitment from people who work in the organization and can foster the image of the organization (Rajab,

2002). According to (Siagian, 2012), professionals are measured by their speed in carrying out function and referring to simplified procedure.

The society is a customer of public services, because the society can directly assess whether the quality of the service provided is good or still not appropriate with society expectations. In the context of service, people will tend to demand perfect, simple, easy and inexpensive. The trend of people whose education level continues to increase will tend to demand if their rights to get public services cannot be served

well. Both good and bad services, they will both produce images, assessments and lead to public trust in the public service providers. Basically, there are three functions of government in the era of autonomy and reform, they are the functions of governance, development and service to the community (Saraswati, 2018). Good or bad quality of service depends on the ability of service providers to fulfill the expectations of the society (service recipients) consistently. Besides being influenced by the quality of service, professionalism and customer satisfaction is also determined by the influence of individual employee performance.

Every public service must have service standards and be published as a guarantee for service recipients. Professionalism is a must-have measure in the administration of public services that must be obeyed by service providers and recipients. Public services can be used as a benchmark for the results of the performance of the government itself to know whether public service is well or not. If the quality of public services has not been successfully achieved according to the objectives, the public services have not run well in accordance with existing satisfaction.

This research background aims to test the hypothesis whether there is a relationship between professionalism and service quality. To test this hypothesis, this study applied meta- analysis as a method for integrating research that has been done before. The correlation meta- analysis aims to obtain the true distribution of correlations between an independent variable and the dependent variable (Hunter & Schmidt, 2004). In this study, the variable studied was professionalism as an independent variable and service quality as the dependent variable.

Individual study is never perfect because of some artifacts that accompany them, they are sampling errors, measurement errors, dichotomization, variable variation ranges, variable structure deviations, transcript errors, and other external influences (Hunter & Schmidt, 2004). This research will only cover sampling errors which are the most influential errors (Hunter & Schmidt, 2004), as well as measurement errors.

#### 2. LITERATURE REVIEW

#### 2.1 Professionalism

Professional is someone who is skilled, reliable and very responsible in carrying out their profession while professionalism means having capabilities, being disciplined in carrying out job, oriented towards achieving results and having high integrity (Arsana, 2016). Professionalism is reliability and expertise in carrying out job so that they are carried out with high quality, right time, meticulously, and with procedures that are easily understood and followed by customers. Professionalism can be interpreted as a person's abilities and skills in doing work according to their respective fields and levels. Professionalism involves fitness between the capabilities possessed by the bereaucratic - competence with the task reguerement, match between ability and need are a requirement for the formation of a professional apparatus. It means that the expertise and capabilities of the authorities reflect the direction and objectives to be achieved by an organization (Siagian, 2009). To create a cadre of professionalism in carrying out the institutional is the availability of reliable human resources, well-programmed work, and the time to carry out the program as well as adequate financial support and supporting facilities (Tamrin, 2009).

Professionals are people who are relied and trusted because they are skilled, have knowledge, responsible, diligent, full of discipline, and serious in carrying out their duties. It makes the term professionalism synonymous with ability, knowledge or education and independence (Maister, 2012). Professionalism is reliability in carrying out tasks so that they are carried out with high quality, right time, careful, and with procedures that are easily understood and followed by customers (Siagian, 2012). Professionalism is an attitude or circumstances in carrying out work that requires expertise through certain education and training and is carried out as a job that is a source of income (Sedarmayanti, 2013).

From the explaination above it can be concluded that professionalism is a responsible attitude in carrying out work that requires expertise, abilities and skills in carrying out tasks in accordance with their respective levels. So it is done with high quality, right time, and careful. Therefore professionalism is an important means to achieve goals, so fostering professionalism is a very important part of management. Every management needs professionalism from every member of the organization.

Employee's professionalism is largely determined by the level of employee capability reflected in daily behavior in the organization. High levels of employee capability will lead to the achievement of

organizational objectives that have been previously planned, if the level of employee ability is low so the organizational goals to be achieved will be slow or even deviate from the main plan.

The term of ability indicates the potential to carry out tasks that may or may not be done. If it is called potential, then the ability is only a strength that is in a person. The term ability can also be used to indicate what someone will be able to do. Not what someone has done. The empolyee contains the following aspects (Hamalik, 2008):

- a. Potential aspects, every employee has dynamic potentials, which continue to develop and can be developed. These potentials include: the power to remember, the power of thinking, the will power, the power of feeling, talent, interest, motivation, and other potentials.
- b. Professionalism and vocational aspects, every employee has the ability and work skills or honesty in a particular field, with the ability and skills, he or she can devote himself in certain jobs and create good results optimally.
- c. Functional Aspects, every employee performs their work appropriately, it means that he or she works according to his or her duties and functions in the appropriate fields, for example an employee who has skills in the electronics field.
- d. Operational Aspects, every employee can utilize the ability and skills in the process and procedure of implementing work activities that are being occupied.
- e. Personal aspects, every employee must have personality traits that support his work, for example an independent and tough attitude, responsible, diligent and diligent.
- f. The Productivity aspect, every employee should have a motive for achievement, strive to succeed and provide results from their work, both in quantity and quality.

Professionalism is needed in the organization. Professional human resources are needed, because it will create good ability and commitment from people who work in the organization and can foster the image of the organization (Rajab, 2002).

Law Number 43 of 1999 about amendments to Law Number 8 of 1974 about the main points of staffing, in article 17 paragraph 2 regulates the appointment of Civil Servants in a position based on the principle of professionalism in accordance with competence, work performance and rank levels set for that position and other objective conditions without differentiating sex, ethnicity, religion and class. A Civil Servant must have this professionalism because some of the demands include:

- a. Duties, principles, functions, authorities and responsibilities that must be carried out are to provide public services.
- b. Good governance
- c. In an effort to offset changes in strategic environment, both the internal environment of the organization, and the external environment of the organization.
- d. The development of science, technology and the ongoing era of globalization cannot be prevented and denied again.

The code of ethics for the employee corps (Kopri), called the Panca Prasetya Employee Corps of the Republic of Indonesia, states that every member of the Republic of Indonesia's employee corps uphold honesty, justice, and discipline as well as increasing welfare and professionalism.

Law Number 43 of 1999 in Article 1 management of Civil Servants (PNS) is the overall effort to increase the effectiveness, efficiency and professionalism of the implementation of the duties, functions and responsibility of staffing which includes planning, procurement, quality development, placement, promotion, welfare and dischange.

Arrangement of human resources / apparatus is carried out by taking into account:

a. Implementation of a merit system in staffing management b.

Effective education and training system

c. Job competency standards d. Job

competency standards e. Job

Classification

f. Employee placement according to expertise

The purpose of the management of Civil Servants (PNS) is to guarantee the implementation of government and development duties in an effective manner with the support of professional, accountable, honest and fair civil servants through coaching that is carried out based on work performance systems and career systems that are selected emphasize the achievement system. According to (Siagian, 2012), professionals are measured by their speed in carrying out functions and referring to simplified procedures. Based on the opinion above, the professional concept in the apparatus is seen in terms of:

#### a. Creativity

The ability of the apparatus to face obstacles in providing services to the public by innovating. It needs to be taken to end the community's bad assessment of the public bureaucracy which is considered rigid at work. The formation of a creative apparatus can only occur if: there is a conducive climate that is able to encourage government officials to look for new ideas and new concepts and apply them innovatively. The willingness of leaders to empower that in participation in decision-making concerning work.

#### b. Innovation

The realization is in the form of a desire and determination to look for, find and use new methods, new work methods, in carrying out their duties. The most basic obstacle of innovative behavior is feeling quickly satisfied with the results of work that has been achieved.

#### c. Responsivity

The ability of the apparatus in anticipating and facing new aspirations, new developments, new demands, and new knowledge, the bureaucracy must respond quickly in order to make it does not to be left in carrying out its duties and functions.

The professionalism characteristics of the apparatus are in accordance with the guidance of good employees, according to Mertin Jr. (in Aneta, 2019) including:

#### a. Equality

The same treatment for services provided. This is based on the type of rational bureaucratic behavior that consistently provides quality services to all parties regardless of political affiliation and social status.

#### b. Equity

The same treatment for the community is not enough, but also a fair treatment. For a pluralistic society, sometimes fair treatment and equal treatment are needed.

#### c. Loyalty

Loyalty to the constitution of the law, leaders, subordinates, and coworkers. The various types of loyalty are bound to one another and no loyalty is absolutely given to one particular type of loyalty regardless of others.

#### d. Accountability

Every government apparatus must be prepared to accept responsibility for whatever is done.

Professionals are people who are skilled, reliable and very responsible in carrying out their profession while professionalism means having capability, being disciplined in carrying out tasks, oriented towards achieving results and having high integrity (Arsana, 2016). Professionalism is one of the important factors that must be possessed by every employee in an organization because professionalism is the properties (abilities, skills and ways of implementing something) that present and carried out by a professional. To create a cadre of professionalism in carrying out the institutional mission the basic requirements are the availability of reliable human resources, well-programmed work, and the time available to carry out the program as well as adequate financial support and supporting facilities (Tamrin, 2009). Professionalism is an important means to achieve goals, so fostering professionalism is a very important part of management. Every management needs professionalism from every member of the organization.

#### 2.2. Service Quality

Services are defined as services provided by the owner or company to prospective

buyers. Service is a pleasant feeling that is given to others along with friendliness and ease to fulfill their needs. Quality as interpreted as ISO 9000 is a combination of nature and characteristics that determine the extent to which outputs can fulfill customer requirements. Customers who determine and assess to what extent the characteristics and characteristics that fulfill the needs. According to Fandy Tjiptono (2015: 157), the quality of service is a measure of how well the level of service provided is able to match customer expectations. In other words, there are two main factors that affect service quality, they are expected service and perceived service. If the service received or recommended is as expected, the quality of service is perceived as good and satisfying. Meanwhile, if the service received or felt is not as expected, the quality of service is perceived as poor quality. Quality must start from customer needs and end on customer perception.

According to Garvin, quoted by Fandy Tjiptono (2015: 143) states that: "there are five qualities, one of which is that the quality seen depends on the people who judge it, so that the product that satisfies one's preferences is the highest quality product". Quality has become the hope and dream for every consumer of a product that he or she bought. Consumers in their daily use products that are tangible or intangible can not be separated from the good quality consumers expect. A saler have to fulfill the desires and needs of consumers, then try to satisfy it to increase sales. Good quality will be able to add satisfaction for consumers to the quality of the product being bought. If consumers get good quality every time they buy a product they need, there is a high chance that the consumer will make repeated purchases and this will benefit the company. Service companies is more enhance the quality of the process, because consumers are usually directly involved in the process. While companies that produce products are more emphasis on results because consumers are generally not involved in the process. A quality alone is often considered a realistic measure of the perfection or goodness of a product or service. The universal definition of quality has several similarities, they are in the following elements:

- a. Quality includes business meeting or exceeding customer expectations.
- b. Quality includes products, services, people, processes and the environment.
- c. Quality is a condition that is always changing.

Basically there are three quality orientations that should be consistent with each other, they are: customer perceptions, products (services), and processes. For goods, these three orientations can almost always be clearly distinguished, but not for services. Whereas services, products, and processes may not be clearly distinguished, even the product is the process itself. One service quality approach that is often used as a reference in marketing research is the Servqual (Service Quality) model developed by Parasuraman, Zeithmal, and Berry Servqual built on the comparison of two main factors, they are customer perception of actual service. Expectations of customers are basically the same as what services companies should provide to customers. These customers' expectations are based on word of mouth information, personal needs, past experience, and external communication (advertising and various other forms of company promotion). According to Parasuraman, Zeithaml, and Berry quoted by Fandy Tjiptono (2015: 198), this definition include:

- a. Empathy, means that the company understands the customer's problems and acts in the customer's interests, as well as giving personal attention to customers and having comfortable operating hours.
- b. Reliability, related to the company's ability to provide accurate services from the first time without making any mistakes and delivering services in accordance with the agreed time.
- c. Responsiveness, regarding the willingness and ability of employees to help customers and respond to their requests, as well as informing at any time they will be provided and then providing services quickly.
- d. Assurance, the behavior of employees able to foster customer confidence in the company and the company usually creates a sense of security for customers. Guarantees also mean that employees are always polite and master the knowledge and skills needed to handle any customer questions or problems.

Based on dimensions above, it can be said that the four dimensions can be used as a measurement tool for companies in providing quality service to customers. According to Fandy Tjiptono (2015: 178), there are factors that cause poor quality of service are as follows:

#### a. Production and Consumption that occur simultaneously

One of the unique characteristics of a service is inseparable, it means that services are produced and consumed at the same time. This often requires the presence and participation of customers in the service delivery process. Consequently, various problems related to interactions between service providers and customers may occur. Some weaknesses that may exist in service employees and may have a negative impact on perceived quality include:

- 1) Not skilled in serving customers
- 2) How to dress employees that are less appropriate to the context
- 3) The employee's words are not polite
- 4) Employee body odor disturbs customer convenience
- 5) The face of employees is always pouting

#### b. High Labor Intensity

Incentive employee involvement in service delivery can also lead to quality problems in the form of high variability that results. Factors that usually affect it include:

- 1) Low wages (generally employees who serve or interact directly with customers have the lowest level of education and wages in a company)
- 2) Inadequate training or even not according to organizational needs
- 3) The employee turnover rate is too high
- 4) Low employee motivation

#### c. Inadequate support for internal customers

Font line employees are the spearhead of the service delivery system. In many cases, the friendliness and courtesy of telephone operators and security guards may make a first impression for potential customers who want to deal with a service provider company. In order for font line employees to be able to serve customers effectively, they need the support of key management functions (operations, marketing, finance, and HR). The support can also be in the form of equipment (tools, materials, clothing, uniforms), skills training and information (for example, operating procedures).

#### d. Communication Gap

If there is a communication gap, a negative perception or perception of service quality can arise. Communication gaps can be:

- 1) Service providers give excessive promises, so they are not able to fulfill them.
- 2) Service providers cannot always present the latest information to customers.
- 3) Service provider communication messages are not understood by customers.
- 4) Service providers do not pay attention or do not immediately follow up on complaints or customer suggestions.

#### e. Treat all customers with the same way

In terms of interactions with service providers, not all customers are willing to receive uniform services, there are often customers who want or even demand services that are personal and different from other customers. This raises challenges for service providers on an individual basis and understands how customers feel about the service providers and the specific services they receive.

#### f. Excessive expansion or development of services

If there are too many new services and additions to existing services, the results obtained are not necessarily optimal, it is even possible that problems arise around service quality standards. In addition, customers can also be confused about differentiating service offerings in terms of features, benefits and quality levels.

#### g. Short-term business vision

Short-term business vision (eg orientation towards achieving annual sales and profit targets, maximum cost savings, increasing annual productivity, etc.) can damage the quality of services that are being formed in the long term.

#### 3.METHOD

This research used Meta-Analysis research as part of the research. Meta-analyst is a

research of a number of research results in a similar problem. Data collection techniques were carried out by searching journals, theses, schemes, scientific articles related to professionalism and service quality through the internet.

Sevannisa (2015) in an article entitled Meta Analysis Research concluded that the definition of metaanalysis is a research activity carried out by analyzing a number of primary studies that discuss similar
problems to obtain a general conclusion. The data is used as a basis to support or reject hypotheses in metaanalysis research. According to Ruswana (2005), the core of meta-analysis research has several objectives
including: (a) To obtain an estimate of effect size, namely the strength of the relationship or the magnitude
of the difference between variables; (b) Inference from data in the sample to the population; (c) Control
potential variables that are confounding so as not to disturb the statistical significance of the relationship or
difference. Furthermore, Ruswana (2005) also suggests that this meta-analysis research has several
advantages including: (a) Meta-analysis encourages mathematical thinking about methods, categorization,
population, interventions, outcomes, and ways to integrate some evidence; (b) Merging data from various
studies will improve generalization capabilities and statistical power, so that the impact of a procedure can
be assessed more fully; (c) The increasing number of individuals in the meta-analysis provides an
opportunity for the interpretation of data about security or danger with greater confidence; (d) A large
number of subjects also allows analysis of sub-groups that cannot be done in the original research; (e) The
results of the meta-analysis can guide further research, including the required sample size.

In the process of this meta-analysis research, the researcher adopted the literature review method carried out by (Durst & Edvardsson, 2012), among others. The literature review method carried out has been systematic and can be applied to the meta-analyst analysis process. The steps taken include: (1) determining the area to be discussed and searching literature, (2) determining inclusion and exclusion criteria, (3) analysis and (4) writing.

The first step, researchers determine the research questions and determine the key words. This research aims to conduct a meta-analysis of the relationship of professionalism to service quality. Based on this area, researchers used key words including professionalism in service quality in various forms to find relevant articles. Articles are searched using an online database through https://scholar.google.co.id/issued 2015 to 2019. All findings of the articles obtained are then considered according to inclusion criteria.

Criteria for articles that can be included for the meta-analysis research in this article include:

- 1. Scientific article that discusses professionalism as an independent variable associated with service quality as the dependent variable.
- 2. Articles use Indonesian.
- 3. Articles published of 2015-2019.

In addition to the inclusion criteria, other articles are included in the exclusion criteria that were not included in the discussion of the meta-analysis study in this article. Based on predetermined criteria, 10 articles were found which were netted at an early stage that discussed professionalism in service quality. The articles found are then summarized in the form of an excel table containing the year, the name of the researcher, the number of samples (N) and sample characteristics. The summary results can be seen in Table 1.

**Table 1. Characteristics of Research Samples** 

No	Year	Researcher	Number of Sample	Characteristics
			(N)	
1.	2015	Ilahude, F., et al.	40	Government Office
2.	2015	Mandey, D., et al.	30	Government Office
3.	2017	Ismatul Mardiyah & M.	22	Government Office
		Daimul Abror		
4.	2017	Amalia	35	Government Office
5.	2017	Jerri Arista	20	Government Office
6.	2018	Tuegeh, L.J.	36	Public Healt Center
7.	2018	Widyaningsih, H.	-	Hotel

8.	2019	Arifin, M.Z., et al.	2	Government Office
9.	2019	Ustaghfiroh, S. & Jumino	92	School Librarian
10.	2019	Annisa, N., et al.	55	Government Office

Data analysis was performed using meta-analysis techniques by Hunter and Schmidt (2004) carried out with the following steps:

- 1. Change the algebraic equation from the value of  $\mathbf{F}$  to the value of  $\mathbf{t} \& \mathbf{r}$
- 2. Barebones meta-analysis for correction of sample errors made by: a. Calculate the mean population correlation; b. Calculate the variance of  $r_{XY}$  ( $\sigma^2$  r); c. Calculate the sampling error variance ( $\sigma^2$  r); d. Impact of sampling

#### 4. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The research sample examined in this meta-analysis study has the characteristics listed in Table 1.

#### Transform F values into t, d and r

There are 7 studies which are comparative studies which are correlational studies that produce a value of r.  $r_{xy}$  values obtained from comparative studies are listed in Table 2.

**Table 2. Transform values** 

No	Year	Researcher	N	F	t	rxy
1	2015	71.1.7	40			
1.	2015	Ilahude, F., et al.	40	-	-	-
2.	2015	Mandey, D., et al.	30	53,027	-	0,809
3.	2017	Ismatul Mardiyah & M. Daimul Abror	22	-	4,583	0,732
4.	2017	Amalia	35	-	6,145	0,539
5.	2017	Jerri Arista	20	-	-	0,619
6.	2018	Tuegeh, L.J.	36	48,411	6,958	0,766
7.	2018	Widyaningsih, H.	-	-	-	-
8.	2019	Arifin, M.Z., et al.	2	-	-	-
9.	2019	Ustaghfiroh, S. & Jumino	92	12,493	4,394	0,796
10.	2019	Annisa, N., et al.	55	15,677	2,386	0,452

#### **Correction of Sampling Error (Bare Bone Meta-Analysis)**

If the population correlation is assumed to be constant among several research, so the best estimate of the correlation is not the simple average of the correlation os several research, but rather the amount of average for each correlation that is devided by the number of sample in the research. The best estimate for population correlation is to follow equation 1:

### a. The Average of Population Correlation

The next Step is change  $r_i$  and  $r_{xy}$  values in each research to get average population correlation. The result is the mean population after corrected by the number of sample ( $\check{r}$ ) is 0.61.

### b. Variance $r_{xy}$ ( $\sigma^2$ r)

Variance  $r_{xy}$  or  $\sigma^2$  r by using equation 2:

$$\mathbf{\hat{\phi}}^{2} r = \frac{\sum \left[ \frac{N(r_{1} - \check{r}) \cdot 2}{\sum N_{1}} \right]}{\sum N_{1}} \dots \text{equation (2)}$$

The result of the calculation of Variance  $r_{xy}$  value or  $\sigma^2$  r is 0,036

#### c. Variant Sampling Error

The  $r_{xy}$  variance of 0.0036 is a mixture of variations in population correlations and variations in sample correlations produced by sampling errors. Estimates of variance in population correlations can be obtained only by correcting the observed variance  $r^2$  r for sampling errors.

Variance of sampling error can be calculated using equation 3.

$$\mathbf{\hat{Q}}^{2}_{\ell} = \frac{(1-2)}{(\check{N}-1)} \dots \text{equation (3)}$$

Based on the value of ř obtained and the average number of samples Ň, the variance of sampling error in this meta-analysis study was 0.00376.

#### d. Estimation of Population Correlation Variance

The real population correlation variance, or variance, is the corrected variance that is the  $r_{xy}$  variance minus the sampling error variance. The population correlation variance can be calculated using equation 4.

So the value of the correlation variance in this meta-analysis study was 0.0322.

#### e. Impact of Sampling Error

The impact of sampling error can be known as follows:

$$\frac{\phi \phi^{2} e}{\phi \phi^{2} e} \times 100\% = \frac{\frac{0,00376}{0,0322}}{0,0322} \times 100\% = 11,67\%$$

Other error factors that have not been specified are 88.33%.

Population correlation after being corrected by sample error was estimated at 0.61, population variance at 0.0322 and standard deviation (SD) at 0.6. With an 88% confidence interval. The mean correlation value after being corrected ř of 0.61 is still within the acceptance limit. Based on these results it shows that the hypothesis stating that there is a relationship between professionalism and service quality is acceptable. The results of the mean correlation after being corrected with a value of 61 of 0.61, indicate that the relationship between professionalism and service quality is moderate. This result indicates two things, they are:

- 1. First it has indeed been proven that professionalism is indeed related to service quality.
- 2. This relationship is not very high.

Both indications are same with several studies of Arista J., 2017, Asih N. B., 2014, Bismawati, 2019 and Surya V. F. Y., 2018 which states that professionalism of employee performance has a strong and significant influence on the quality of public services.

#### 5. DISCUSSION

Research on professionalism and service quality based on research objectives obtained by the largest ratio researching the application / implementation of public service professionalism. This proves that the application / implementation / professionalism of public

services can analyze and evaluate the achievement of quality public service professionalism. The achievement of professional quality of public service companies / government offices / hotels obtained from the application of professional impact on the quality of public services. The results of the proof can be used as a reference for researchers in the field of professionalism and service quality to develop research with professionalism and service quality to achieve quality service to improve professionalism.

#### **CONCLUSION**

The results of the meta-analysis that have been done provide support to the research hypothesis which states that professionalism is related to service quality with a correlation level of r=0.61. The role of professionalism in employee performance has a strong and significant influence on the quality of public services.

#### REFERENCES

- Amalia, S. (2017). The Influence of Employee Professionalism on the Quality of Public Services at the Sungai Kokong District Sub-District Office, Samarinda. Public Administration, 1 (1), 251-255.
- Annisa, N., Kusuma, A. R., & Hasanah, N. (2019). The Influence of Education Level and Work Professionalism on Service Quality in Long Kali Sub-District Office, Paser Regency.
- Arifin, M. Z., Afifuddin, A., & Abidin, A. (2019). Professionalism in Improving Performance Against Public Service Quality (Case Study in the Lowokwaru District Office in Malang). Public Response, 13 (2), 24-32.
- Arista, J. (2017). The Effect of Professionalism of Employee Work on the Quality of Public Services (Study at the West Kutai District Inspectorate). Prediction, 3 (3), 196-200.
- Arista, J. (2017). The Effect of Professionalism of Employee Work on the Quality of Public Services (Study at the West Kutai District Inspectorate). PREDICTION, 3 (3), 196-200
- Arsana, I. P. J., & Jati, P. (2016). Engineer Professional Ethics. Building Attitudes Professionalism in Engineering.
- Asih, N. B. (2014). The Influence of Employee Professionalism on the Quality of Birth Certificate Making Services in the Population and Civil Registration Office of Jember Regency.
- Bismawati, B. Effect of Employee Performance on Public Service Quality in the Regional Disaster Management Agency of North Mamuju Regency. Catalog, 4 (3).
- Durst, S., & Edvardsson, I. R. (2012). Knowledge management in SMEs: a literature review. Journal of Knowledge Management, 16 (6), 879–903.
- Hamalik, O. (2008). Learning models: Developing Teacher Professionalism. Jakarta: Rajawali Press
- Hunter, J., E., and Schmidt, F., L. (2004). Methods of Meta-Analysis: Corecting Errors and Bias in Research Findings. Newbury Park: Sage Publications.
- I Putu Jati Arsana, Procurement Management, (Yogyakarta: CV Budi Utama, 2016), p. 62 Ilahude, F., & Tampongangoy, D. L. (2015). The Effect of Professionalism of Village Officers on the Quality of Public Services (A Study in the Mapanget District of Manado City). JOURNAL OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION, 4 (32).
- Maister, D. H., Galford, R., & Green, C. (2012). True Professionalism: The Courage To Care About Your Clients & Career. Simon and Schuster.
- Mandey, D. J., Mandey, J., & Tulusan, F. (2015). The Effect of Professionalism of Village Officers on the Quality of Public Services in Malalayang One Village, Malalayang District, Manado City. JOURNAL OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION, 3 (031).

- The International Conference on Innovations in Social Sciences and Education (ICoISSE) Bandung, Indonesia, July 25<sup>th</sup>, 2020
- Mardiyah, I., & Abror, M. D. (2017). The Influence of the Adoption of the Citizen's Charter Model Against the Professionalism of Apparatus Work and the Quality of Public Services. Scientific Journal of Public Administration, 7 (2), 69-80.
- Rajab, B. (2002). Professionalism in the Transition of Civilization. Jakarta: Gramedia First Literature.
- Rajab, B. (2002). Professionalism in the Transition of Civilization. Jakarta: Gramedia First Literature.
- Ruswana, A. (2005). Meta Analysis. Bandung: Faculty of Medicine, UNPAD.
  Saraswati, E. I. (2018). Aanal Customer Service Quality in Handling City Plan Certificate in the Surabaya One-Stop Integrated Service Unit. Journal of Administrative Applications, 19 (1), 10-18.
- Awarmayanti. (2013). Human Resource Management: Bureaucratic Reform and Management of Civil Servants. Bandung: Refika Aditama.
- Siagian, S. P. (2012). Development Administration Concepts, Dimensions, Their Categories. Jakarta: Earth Literacy. Subrata Sumadi.
- Siagian, S. P. (2012). Development Administration Concepts, Dimensions, Their Categories. Jakarta: Earth Literacy. Subrata Sumadi.
- Surya, V. F. Y. The Influence of Employee Performance on Service Quality in Pajarakan Community Health Center, Probolinggo Regency (Doctoral dissertation).
- Tamrin, A. S., Rumapea, P., & Mambo, R. (2017). Effect of Employee Professionalism on Customer Satisfaction Level at the Office of PT. Taspen Manado Branch ". Journal of Public Administration, 3 (046).
- Tamrin, A. S., Rumapea, P., & Mambo, R. (2017). Effect of Employee Professionalism on Customer Satisfaction Level at the Office of PT. Taspen Manado Branch ". JOURNAL OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION, 3 (046).
- Tjiptono, Fandy. (2005). Brand Management and Strategy. Publisher: ANDI, Yogyakarta.
- Tjiptono, Fandy., & Chandra, Gregory. 2011. Service, Quality and Satisfaction Edition 3. Cv. Andi Offset. Yogyakarta.506 p.
- Tjiptono, Fandy., And Chandra, Gregory. 2012. Strategic Marketing Edition 2: Analyzing Strategic Marketing, Branding Strategy, and E-marketing. CV Andi Offset. Yogyakarta. 492 p.
- Tjiptono, Fandy., And Chandra, Gregory. 2015. Service, Quality and Satisfaction Edition 4. Cv. Andi Offset. Yogyakarta.
- Tuegeh, L. J., Rumapea, P., & Kolondam, H. (2018). The Effect of Midwife Professionalism on the Quality of Maternal and Child Health Services in the Tatelu Health Center. Journal of Public Administration, 4 (49).
- Ustaghfiroh, S., & Jumino, J. (2019). The Effect of Librarian Professionalism on the Quality of Information Services at the State High School 1 Kendal Library in Kendal Regency. Journal of Library Sciences, 6 (4), 181-190.
- Wahyuningsih, S. S., Darmayanti, T., & Bintarti, A. (2019). Meta Analysis of Open University Online Tutorials. Journal of Open and Distance Education, 20 (1), 32-38.
- Widyaningsih, H. (2018). Efforts to Increase Employee Professionalism to Improve the Quality of Employee Services of Abadi Hotel Jogja. Treasury of Tourism and Culture Journal, 9 (1).